Ekonometria 25 2009

nr 65

Bartłomiej Rodawski, Anna Baraniecka

Wroclaw University of Economics

MODEL OF SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT PROFICIENCY

Summary: The article focuses on supply chain management proficiency. According to the authors, companies have to go through four stages in order to develop supply chain management expertise. Each of the stage is described by means of enablers (features of a management system that allow to reach higher stage) and elements (features of supply chain management at each stage).

Key words: supply chain management, supply chain proficiency, stages to develop SCM expertise, enablers, elements.

1. Introduction

Supply chain can be defined as a group of companies (starting from first suppliers, ending at retailers) that cooperate to provide a final customer with a value (product and/or service that she/he expects). Accordingly supply chain management should be comprehended as managing all intra and inter organizational activities that create value for the final customer. The article focuses on supply chain management proficiency. According to the authors, companies have to go through four stages in order to develop supply chain management expertise.

2. Supply chain management best practice

World class supply chain management that is perceived as a sustainable source of competitive advantage, has the following features:

- supply chain members share common goals and formulate mutual supply chain strategies;
- supply chain members cooperate in the development of mid- and short-term business plans;
- supply chain performance is measured globally (not only locally), which facilitates eradication of sub-optimization;
- intra and inter-organizational processes are co-managed by various departments and companies (supply chain partners);

- market data drives supply chain activities (e.g. procurement, manufacturing or delivery);
- new products are launched in a fast and effective manner;
- sophisticated IT technologies are utilized to gather, analyze and share business information between supply chain partners in a real time.

Presumably most of the supply chains do not meet all the listed features. Only a few companies could name their supply chains world class systems. Those organizations are global industry leaders. They have already managed to implement sophisticated SCM solutions. But foremost they have shifted their mindset, being now able to "think outside the box" i.e. they are willing to partner with members of their supply chains, i.e. other independent organizations.

On the other hand, most of the companies have been trying to undertake some supply chain initiatives, doing it more or less consciously. Those are usually internal projects aiming at streamlining value adding processes or eliminating conflicting business goals. In some instances the initiatives in question go beyond a single company, and lead to cooperation with strategic suppliers or customers.

Therefore, it should be stated flatly that a world class supply chain management is a long term, multi stage process/project, and most companies are at different stages of their route to supply chain management proficiency. Below the four stages model is briefly described.

3. Evolution model

The model consists of two parts: enablers and managements elements. Enablers facilitate reaching the next stage of supply chain proficiency. They should be regarded as a supply chain management environment. The enablers were divided into soft and hard ones. The first group is connected to organizational culture and seems to be the most difficult to change (improve) in a short run. Unfortunately, according to observations cultural elements are most often ignored while implementing supply chain projects. Hard enablers embrace organizational structure, IT technologies and cost management systems. Organizational issues are usually omitted, similarly to cultural elements. However, sophisticated IT technologies and cost management approaches are more often implemented. Nonetheless the potential they provide is not fully utilized, mostly due to cultural and organizational elements that lag behind.

Management elements consist of strategic issues and processes. At strategic levels supply chain goals, design, plans and measures have to be considered. Based on observations, the authors assume that most supply chains have no goals and long term plans set, accordingly supply chain efficiency and effectiveness are not measured. Mastering supply chain processes is closely connected with their streamlining and integration. At the first two levels of supply chain proficiency internal integration is achieved. Afterwards inter-organizational integration of processes should be accomplished.

Table 1. Soft enablers of supply chain management proficiency

| Feature | I | II | III | VI | ^ |
|--------------------------------|--|---|--|---|--|
| | No – integration (conflicting goals) | Internal integration (consistent goals) | Selective external Full integration integration (aligning goals adaptive supply chain) | Full integration (adaptive supply chain) | |
| | | | with strategic partners) | Leadership | Partnership |
| Atmosphere | Internal Conflicts, Internal Competition goal, Educations, Understanding | Vision of common goal, Educations, Understanding | Interesting in Collaborations "outside of leader the box" | Domination of the leader | Equality of all partners |
| Attitude | "I have nothing to do with it" | "we have mutual goals for all internal processes" and processes with selected supply chain members" | "we have mutual goals and processes with selected supply chain members" | Leader is a "role model", others follow and help him. | We all are authors of long term supply chain success |
| Supply chain innovation driver | Logistics | Top management | Managers of Sales, Purchasing, etc. (Business unit leaders) | Top management | Top management |
| Dominating relations | Put pressure on other departments (suppliers, clients) | Joint inter-departmental cooperation | External visits, talks, project teams, first initiatives | Cyclical meetings with supply chain members, mutual initiatives, exchange of staff among supply chain members | supply chain members, ange of staff among |

Source: authors own descriptions.

Table 2. Hard enablers of supply chain management proficiency

| Feature | Ι | П | III | VI | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | No – integration (conflicting goals) | Internal integration (consistent goals) | als | Full integration (adaptive supply chain) | |
| | | | with strategic partners) | Leadership | Partnership |
| Costing systems | Traditional, budgets of departments | Traditional, business plans, costs of processes | Costs of joint processes | Activity based costing implemented by chosen partners | Activity based costing |
| Organizational structure | Functional | Matrix | Process | Varies across the supply chain | Adjusted to supply chain strategy |
| IT technologies MRP – data processing | MRP | ЕКР | ERP, CRM, SRM, APS (limited), data warehouses | ERP, CRM, SRM, APS, data warehouses | ERP, CRM, SRM, APS (including ATP); data warehouses |
| IT technologies – information exchange | 1 | Intranet | Intranet, extranet, EDI | Intranet, extranet, EDI, integration of IT systems | Intranet, extranet, EDI, integration of IT systems across supply chain |

Source: authors own descriptions.

Table 3. Elements of supply chain management proficiency - strategic issues

| Full integration (adaptive supply chain) | Partnership | Formulated for each customer segment | Join design of supply chain. Lean/agile, leagile approach with regards to capacities of partners | Advanced IT technology, demand; sophisticated technologies (e.g. QR, ECR) |
|--|--------------------------|--|---|--|
| Full int (adaptive su | Leadership | Formulated for each customer segment. Leader migrates to the most profitable areas of SC | Leader designs supply chain. Lean/agile, leagile approach imposed by the leader with regards to capacities of partners | Leader: orchestrates the supply chain using sophisticated approaches (e.g. QR, ECR); others: meet leader's instructions and customer needs |
| Selective external integration (aligning goals | with strategic partners) | Costs/ service | Internal supply Chain designed; lean external supply chain designed; lean designed; usually lean approach | Activity based costing, CPFR, VMI |
| Internal integration | (consistent goals) | Costs | Internal supply chain designed; lean approach | Process approach, IT technology |
| No – integration | | | None | Budgets |
| Elements | | Goals SCM | SCM strategy | Areas of interest |

Source: authors own descriptions.

Table 4. Elements of supply chain management proficiency - customer facing processes

| Full integration (adaptive supply chain) | Leadership Partnership | Leader mainly responsible forecasting, planning and for long and mid term supply chain forecasts and supply chain forecasts and plans. Other supply chain members have to adjust their plans to the leader. SCM strategy imposed by the leader. | Co-operation on strategic level limited to selected members of supply chain. Basic elements of market segmentation and utilization across supply chain. Broad co-operation on consumer and service design. Category management | All marketing activities Consumer Centric in supply chain conform Organization. Joint to marketing brands of programmes across the supply chain | Leader designs distribution network or must accept long-term solutions. Cooperation in distribution channels is Coordination provided by distribution channels is Joint design, realizing and controlling the process with all partners. Coordination provided by and or 4th party logistics |
|--|--------------------------|--|--|---|---|
| | Le | Leader mafor long ar supply chaplans. Oth members herir plans SCM stratthe leader. | Co-operation on s level limited to se members of suppl Basic elements of market segmentati implemented acro supply chain | All markei in supply of to market the leader | Leader designs distribution net must accept lon solutions. Coop distribution cha common |
| Selective external integration (aligning goals | with strategic partners) | Sharing forecasts, plans or schedules with selected clients and suppliers (first CPFR, VMI, CR initiatives) | Access to market data granted to selected suppliers. Demand information shared with distribution partners | Clients participate in marketing programmes design and implementation. "Quality" discounts | Cooperation on the process with selected partners (e.g. VMI, CO). 3th party logistics often contracted |
| Internal integration (consistent goals) | · | SOP comprehensive accessibility of business information within a company | Initial initiatives enabling market data accumulation and processing | Common goals for marketing, sales and other departments (e.g. profit maximization, client profitability optimization). | Logistics department responsible for realization and control. Goals: adapted to strategic goals of the company (e.g. profit maximization); trade-offs considered |
| No – integration (conflicting goals) | | Individual forecasting, planning and scheduling in each functional area (e.g. budgets of departments) | None (knowledge about clients in marketing & sales departments) | Main goals: sales maximization, client satisfaction. Conflicts with other functional areas | Responsibility for realizing and controlling decentralized (e.g. material flows in logistics departments, product flow in sales departments). Goals: costs minimization; no trade-offs considered |
| Elements | | Forecasting Planning | Consumer Relationship Management | Marketing & Sales | Distribution, transportation warehousing |

Source: authors own descriptions.

Table 5. Elements of supply chain management proficiency - back office processes

| Elements | No – integration (conflicting goals) | Internal integration (consistent goals) | Selective external integration (aligning goals | Full integration (adaptive supply chain) | gration pply chain) |
|--|--|---|---|--|--|
| | | | with strategic partners) | Leadership | Partnership |
| Research & Development | Activities focused on new products commercialization | Activities focused on commercialization of profitable products (co-operation with other departments, multifunctional teams) | Co-operation with consumer and clients; co-operation with suppliers to improve profitability | Co-operation on new product design and commercialization with limited trust. Leader orchestrates the process | Common (with suppliers and clients) product design and commercialization – project teams |
| Operations | "Isolated island" – no integration with distribution and procurement | Internal integration with procurement and delivery. Lean manufacturing initiatives | Production system Production activitie integrated with procurement orchestrated by the and distribution of selected schedule of the lear partners | Production activities orchestrated by the schedule of the leader | Real customer demand drives and coordinates operations across the chain |
| Inventory Management | Responsibility for inventory management decentralized. Usually heuristic approach to inventory control | Company wide systematic approach to inventory management. Formal inventory control models utilized | Joint inventory management initiatives with selected supply chain members (e.g. VMI, Cross Docking). | Leader controls inventory throughout the supply chain | Joint approaches to optimize inventory levels, and allocate inventory throughout the chain (in cooperation with 3 rd or 4 th arry logistics) |
| Supplier Relationship Management | none Knowledge about suppliers in purchasing, operations, logistics or quality control departments | Procedures enabling collecting and processing data about suppliers | Suppliers integration. Programmes to develop selected suppliers | Leader integrates and develops all suppliers | Partnership with suppliers |
| Purchasing | Reduction of buying costs. Conflicts with other functional areas | Common goals with other areas (e.g. profit maximization through purchasing costs reduction or suppliers profitability growth) | "Quality" based supplier assessment. Broad exchange of business information with selected suppliers. Relation marketing in purchasing | Leader controls and/or coordinates purchasing across the chain | Purchasing activities jointly coordinated across supply chain |

Source: authors own descriptions.

Table 6. Elements of supply chain management proficiency - other processes

| | | e u | l cess | la , s |
|---|----------------|---|---|---|
| | Partnership | ng with to realiz in goals i nagement | tion and across chain. All ve the action | unizationith all scus shain ut |
| Full integration (adaptive supply chain) | Part | Co-operating with all partners to realize supply chain goals in returns management | Data collection and processing across the supply chain. All partners have the access to information | Inter – organizational trainings with all partners. Focus on supply chain management optimization – adaptation of supply chains to customer needs. Sharing knowledge and ideas across supply chain |
| Full integration iptive supply ch | | .u | | |
| Ful (adapti | rship | Leader cooperates with 3 rd party logistics to improve return management in supply chain | Data collection and processing across the supply chain. Some information available to leader only. Leader defines the rules of information management | Training programmes controlled by a leader. Usually the leader is a "teacher" sharing knowledge and ideas across supply chain |
| | Leadership | Leader cooperates with 3 rd party logistics to improvreturn managemen supply chain | Data collection and processing across to supply chain. Som information availate to leader only. Leader defines the rules of information management | Training programm controlled by a leader. Usually th leader is a "teacher sharing knowledge and ideas across supply chain |
| | | Lea with logi logi retu | Dat proof supplied in to lear Lear rule mat | Trai con a le leac shai and supj |
| Selective external integration (aligning goals with strategic | iers) | Co-operation with selected partners on returns management. | Data collection and processing with selected partners | Inter – organization all trainings with selected partners focus on supply chain management improvement |
| elective egration | partners) | Co-operation with selected partners on returns management | Data collection and processing with selepartners | Inter – organization trainings with select partners focus on sichain management improvement |
| Sint | à | Co-o selec returi | Data coll processii partners | Inter traini partn chair impr |
| Internal integration (consistent goals) | compared Some) | Realize and control of returns flow for the whole system. First "begin of the pipe" activity. Multifunctional teams | Data collection and processing within departments. Information accessible for all departments | Inter – department trainings. Basic data on products, technical specifications and service exchanged with external organizations. Sector specific or universal standards of co-operation harnessed (e.g. ISO, HACAP, GMP) |
| In | | Realiz of retu whole "begir activit teams | Data proce depar acces depar | Inter- trainini on pro specif servic exterr Sector unive co-op GMP |
| No – integration (conflicting goals) | | Activities focused on re-distributions ("end of the pipe" activity). The main goals: reduce costs of returns flow and obey the laws | Data collection and processing within departments. Conventional methods of communications | Intra-department trainings. Knowledge about suppliers and clients based on transactions. Basic data on products and service exchanged with external organizations. |
| | | | | Tra ab |
| Elements | | Returns Management | Information Management | Training |

Source: authors own descriptions.

4. Stages of the model

Stage 1

No integration (conflicting goals): the main feature of this stage are conflicting goals between departments. Most frequent problems occurs between marketing (including sales) and logistics (understood as purchasing, production control and distribution). Common example of marketing goal is sales maximization, while logisticians have to decrease costs (eg. transport, inventories, production changeovers). Since the main focus is put on internal problems, cooperation with suppliers and clients is limited to "simple transactions" mostly based on price and sector quality standards.

Stage 2

Internal integration (consistent goals): the common business goals are formulated, and broken down into functional areas of the company. Accordingly, conflicts of goals that occurred at stage one are eradicated. Processes are mapped, integrated and streamlined. Usually integrated IT system is introduced at this stage. Demand management (information management, forecasting, planning) is proving to be an important process – the better the knowledge about customer needs, the easier to orchestrate all the activities starting from purchasing, ending at delivery.

Stage 3

Selective integration (aligning goals with strategic partners) – the company breaks the wall to integrate chosen processes with carefully selected partners (suppliers or customers). Bottle-necks are identified and improvements are sought as it comes to inter-organizational processes. Initiatives concerning collaborative sales and operations planning as well as new product design are launched (e.g. collaboration with chosen logistics provider who introduces warehouse and/or transport management system, improving efficiency of distribution network of the partner, collaboration with key account on product configuration). Online business portals are shared with chosen partners.

Stage 4

Full integration (adaptive supply chain) – at this stage supply chain management becomes the source of sustainable competitive advantage. The companies design and manage various supply chains (nets) adjusted to the consumer needs/products. The employees are mentally and technically ready to cooperate closely with many external partners, formulating inter-organizational project teams. Wide range of sophisticated management methods and techniques are implemented to improve efficiency of inter-organizational processes. Within such an environment full potential of IT technologies and management tools is exploited and supply chain becomes demand driven.

It should be stressed that there are **two types of supply chains at the highest level**. First type (called "the lord of the ring") is based on control, brought by a market leader (usually globally recognized brand) who designs and formulates the rules of material and information flows within supply chain. The leader, trying to optimize supply chain performance (and its own profits), distributes tasks among other members. Although

supply chain is orchestrated by the leader, it is possible that certain supply chain nodes (members) are not necessarily perfect as it comes to supply chain management. The leader mostly cares for strategic and tactic issues. The every day operations are left to other members. Not every member is capable of implementing best practices proposed by the leader. Such a member usually lags behind.

The second (called "the fellowship of the ring"), based on partnership, i.e. symmetry between business partners as it comes to the bargaining power and access to business information. In such chains leader is usually replaced by the group of two or more players that collaborate with other partners to improve innovativeness of the chain.

As noted earlier reaching higher level of supply chain proficiency should be considered as an important step towards the sustainable source of competitive advantage, hence affecting positively the bottom line of a company. However, next to potential benefits, supply chain management development necessitates costs, including investments (e.g. IT systems), consulting, trainings, etc. Accordingly, projects aimed at improving the supply chain proficiency should be assessed with due diligence. In other words benefits (e.g. decreased inventories) as well as costs should be forecasted.

The main goal of the presented above model was to simplify the supply chain management reality. Probably companies would not feet neatly into a certain stage. The initial research conducted among pharmaceutical companies proves that each of them reached various stages, depending upon enabler or element. However, the authors suggest that the stage of supply chain proficiency is determined by the dominating number of identified enablers and elements at a certain stage. For example, based on interview conducted with logistics manager, it has been proved that a pharmaceutical producer has most of the features typical for stage one, although IT technologies implemented were characteristic for stage three. "Soft enablers" were diagnosed as the main obstacle to move to the higher, second level. Below some other short cases are presented.

Example 1

Producer of packaging for pharmaceutical products,

Current stage: 1

Enablers (soft): Closed organizational culture; focus on internal problems. Suboptimization. Hierarchical relations.

Enablers (hard): Legacy IT systems for each departments without possibility of integrating them. Traditional budgeting methods. Traditional functional structure.

Elements

Conflicting goals between departments. e.g. marketing and sales departments goal is sales maximization, purchasing goal is to decrease buying and transport costs, production goal is to decrease production changeovers costs and quality stability, financial departments goal is to reduce inventory costs. Cooperation with suppliers and clients is limited to "simple transactions" mostly based on price and quality standards. Supply chain management philosophy does not exist.

| | I | II | III | IVa | IVb |
|---|----------|-----------------|-----|-----|-----|
| Enablers – Soft | | | | | |
| Atmosphere | X | | | | |
| Attitude | x | | | | |
| Supply chain innovation driver | x | | | | |
| Dominating relations | X | | | | |
| Enablers – Hard | | | | | |
| Costing systems | x | | | | |
| Organizational structure | x | | | | |
| IT technologies – data processing | x | | | | |
| IT technologies – information exchange | x | | | | |
| Elements | | | | | |
| Goals SCM | x | | | | |
| Strategy of SCM | x | | | | |
| Areas of interest | x | | | | |
| Forecasting Planning | x | | | | |
| Consumer Relationship Management | * | | | | |
| Marketing & Sales | x | | | | |
| Research & Development | x | | | | |
| Distribution, transportation, warehousing | * | | | | |
| Operations | | \rightarrow X | | | |
| Inventory Management | ¥ | | | | |
| Supplier Relationship Management | x | | | | |
| Purchasing | | | | | |
| Returns Management | x | | | | |
| Information Management | | | | | |
| Training | x | | | | |

Fig. 1. Packaging producer profile

Source: authors own descriptions.

Example 2

Pharmaceutical producer

Current stage: 2, trying to reach stage 3

Enablers (soft): The culture is open for external cooperation but still focused on the internal common goal.

Enablers (hard): Integrated IT system is introduced but used only for selected departments and in small part of its potential. The company introduced Activity Based Costing but focused only on measures of product profitability. Matrix organizational structure (project teams are put on functional structure).

Elements

Common business goal (to maximize profit) is broken down into functional areas of the company. Processes are mapped, integrated and streamlined. Demand is planned but the responsibility for the process in question is not clearly defined. Sup-

ply chain manager post is created, however, it is responsible for internal processes only. Relations with suppliers and clients are still managed by heads of purchasing and sales (marketing).

| | I | II | III | IVa | IVb |
|---|-----|----------|-----|-----|-----|
| Enablers - Soft | | | | | |
| Atmosphere | | X | | | |
| Attitude | | X | | | |
| Supply chain innovation driver | X | | | | |
| Dominating relations | X | | | | |
| Enablers - Hard | | | | | |
| Costing systems | | X | | | |
| Organizational structure | | X | | | |
| IT technologies – data processing | | X | | | |
| IT technologies – information exchange | | X | | | |
| Elements | | | | | |
| Goals SCM | | X | | | |
| Strategy of SCM | | X | | | |
| Areas of interest | _ | Х | | | |
| Forecasting Planning | X < | | | | |
| Consumer Relationship Management | | X | | | |
| Marketing & Sales | | X | | | |
| Research & Development | | X | | | |
| Distribution, transportation, warehousing | | X | | | |
| Operations | | X | | | |
| Inventory Management | | X | | | |
| Supplier Relationship Management | | X | | | |
| Purchasing | | X | | | |
| Returns Management | | <i>X</i> | | | |
| Information Management | | v | X | | |
| Training | | X | | | |

Fig. 2. Pharmaceutical producer

Source: authors own descriptions.

Example 3

Global chemical (pharmaceutical) producer

Current stage: 3, trying to go to stage 4

Enablers (soft): culture is wide open for internal and external relations but cooperation is possible only with selected partners.

Enablers (hard): for selected partners Company proposes the universal IT solutions. Support in trainings and supply chain infrastructure investment financing is also provided to the strategic partners. Online business portals are shared with chosen partners. The company introduced Activity Based Costing to measure product,

clients and suppliers profitability. The method is also promoted across the supply chain.

Elements

Demand management proved to be an important process, which is based on historical and real demand data. Initiatives concerning collaborative sales and operations planning are harnessed (e.g. collaboration with chosen logistics provider who introduces warehouse and/or transport management system, improving efficiency of distribution network of the partner, collaboration with key account on product configuration). Supply chain management departments are responsible for designing and implementing supply chain strategy.

| | I | II | III | IVa | IVb |
|--|---|----|---------------------------------------|-----|--|
| Enablers – Soft Atmosphere Attitude Supply chain innovation driver Dominating relations Enablers – Hard Costing systems Organizational structure IT technologies – data processing | | | X X | | ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** |
| Elements Goals SCM Strategy of SCM Areas of interest Forecasting Planning Consumer Relationship Management Marketing & Sales Research & Development Distribution, transportation, warehousing Operations Inventory Management Supplier Relationship Management Purchasing Returns Management Information Management Training | | | X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X | | X X X X |

Fig. 3. Global pharmaceutical producer

Source: authors own descriptions.

Literature

- Croxton K.L., Gggarcia-Dastugue S.J., Labmert D.M., Rogers D.S., *The supply chain management processes*, "International Journal of Logistics Management" 2001, vol. 12, no 2, s. 14-30.
- Hines P., Lamming R., Jones D., Cousins P., Rich N., Value Stream management strategy and excellence in the supply chain, Financial Times Prentice Hall, Harlow 2000, s. 322-323.
- Porier C.C., A survey of supply chain progress, "Supply Chain Management Review" 2003, September/ October, s. 40-47.
- Porier C.C., Advanced supply chain management: how to build a sustained competitive advantage, Berrett-Koehler Publishers, 1999.
- Rutkowski K. (red.), Zintegrowany lańcuch dostaw. Doświadczenia globalne i polskie, SGH Warszawa 1999, s. 28.
- Simchi-Levi D., Kaminsky P., Simchi-Levi E., *Designing and managing the supply chain. concepts, strategies, and case studies*, Irwin Mc Graw-Hill, Boston 2000, s. 243-244.
- Supply Chain Council, Supply Chain Reference Model v. 8.0, www.supply-chain.org, 2006.

MODEL DOSKONAŁOŚCI ZARZĄDZANIA ŁAŃCUCHEM DOSTAW

Streszczenie: Artykuł opisuje model doskonałości zarządzania łańcuchem dostaw. Zdaniem autorów przedsiębiorstwa muszą przejść przez cztery etapy, aby osiągnąć najwyższy poziom zaawansowania w zarządzaniu łańcuchem dostaw. Każdy z etapów jest opisany za pomocą uwarunkowań (cech systemu zarządzania, które umożliwiają przejście na wyższy poziom) oraz elementów (cech łańcucha dostaw charakterystycznych dla każdego poziomu).